



# Exploring The Importance And Application Of Licensing Law In Environmental Protection In Indonesia

Agung Prasetyo<sup>1</sup>, Slamet Riyanto<sup>2</sup>, Ibrahim Fikma<sup>3</sup>

<sup>1,2</sup> Faculty of Law, Universitas Muhammadiyah Kotabumi, Indonesia

**Abstract:** Environmental pollution in Indonesia is a serious issue that affects a wide area. This article discusses the impacts of environmental issues, particularly related to the underdevelopment in Indonesia. One preventive measure taken to address environmental pollution is the implementation of a legal permitting policy system. However, there are several issues within the permitting policy, including the mismatch between permitting policies and environmental issues in the respective regions. This article discusses the role of permitting laws in supporting environmental preservation and how law enforcement in the field of permitting law can address cases of environmental degradation. In the research context, the author uses normative and empirical legal research methods. In the main discussion, the article explains the role of permitting laws in supporting environmental preservation, including human rights related to the environment and applicable regulations. Furthermore, the author discusses law enforcement in the permitting domain related to cases of environmental destruction, including the types of administrative and criminal sanctions that can be applied.

**Keywords:** Environmental, Law, Licensing

## 1. Introduction

Environmental pollution in Indonesia is not merely a local issue but a serious threat that extends throughout the entire country. The presence of significant impacts from this pollution, especially when compared to developed nations, underscores the urgency of understanding this issue comprehensively. Adharani indicates that the developmental disparities serve as the root cause of environmental problems in Indonesia. Rochmani reports that various environmental issues have led to a direct and indirect decline in environmental quality, including pollution of water, soil, air, and mining products (Eka Lestari et al., 2019a).

Despite Indonesia's wealth in biological and environmental resources, it suffers losses due to cases of environmental pollution. Furthermore, the slow response to environmental pollution can result in natural disasters and the loss of natural habitats—an unfortunate situation given that Indonesia's climate supports life (Glica Aini Suniaprily et al., 2023a).

Addressing environmental issues requires the involvement of all relevant parties and collective efforts to preserve the environment. These efforts involve preventive measures, as proposed by Rachmadi through the implementation of a legal licensing policy system. This step is considered reasonable as the primary function of licensing laws is to prevent and address environmental problems. In this context, every business and industry in Indonesia is obligated to obtain permits as stipulated in Article 18(1) of Law No. 32/2009 concerning Environmental Protection and Management (UUPPLH) (Education et al., n.d.).

However, the implementation of the legal licensing system is not without its challenges, including the presence or absence of permits, the accuracy of the permit system,

### Correspondence:

Name Slamet Riyanto

Email [riyant\\_dsupts@yahoo.co.id](mailto:riyant_dsupts@yahoo.co.id).

Received: Feb 21, 2024;

Revised: Feb 26, 2024;

Accepted: Feb 27, 2024;

Published: Feb 29, 2024



**Copyright:** © 20xx by the authors. Submitted for possible open access publication under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons

Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0 International License (CC BY-NC 4.0) license (<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>).

stringent licensing requirements, permit misuse, violations, and unpermitted activities related to environmental conservation. The mismatch between licensing policies and environmental issues in relevant areas presents a hurdle that needs to be overcome. Hence, further investigation in the form of this research becomes increasingly urgent, as these issues have the potential to become regulatory concerns similar to positive law. Local governments also play a crucial role in prioritizing environmental interests through regional licensing policies.

With intervention from both the Central and Regional Governments concerning legal licensing policies, it is expected that issues surrounding environmental pollution can be minimized, ensuring the sustainability and preservation of the environment in Indonesia (Glica Aini Suniaprily et al., 2023b).

This article seeks to contribute by breaking down the discussion into two main aspects: the role of legal licensing in supporting environmental conservation and how law enforcement in the field of legal licensing can help address environmental damage. Thus, this research aims to provide in-depth insights into how the licensing system can protect and maintain environmental sustainability in Indonesia, serving as a foundation for improvements and enhancements in relevant policies.

## 2. Materials and Methods

This research utilises a normative juridical research approach to explore the implications. This research is a type of normative legal research. The approach used to conduct analysis in this study is a statutory approach or statute approach, which is combined with a conceptual approach. Literature studies are carried out for the analysis of legal products, namely laws and regulations related to licensing, which are research materials in the form of legal materials, which are the main object of analysis to understand the existing legal framework.

## 3. Results and Discussion

### 3.1. *The role of licensing law in supporting environmental conservation*

The problem of environmental damage is a challenge that needs to be overcome together. This obstacle has existed for a long time, and efforts to deal with it have not reached the optimal level. Many laws include regulations related to rights and obligations related to the environment, one of which is stated in Article 28 (H) Paragraph (1) of the 1945 Constitution which reads: "Everyone has the right to live a prosperous life outwardly, reside, and get a good and healthy living environment and have the right to health services." This article establishes the right of everyone to enjoy physical and mental well-being, to have a place to live, and to experience a good and healthy living environment. In addition, this article also recognizes the right of individuals to receive health services. (Listiyani et al., 2018a)

Article 5 (1) of Law No. 32 of 2009 affirms that, "Every individual has equal rights to a good and healthy living environment." This article emphasizes the principle of equality in access to and benefits of a good environment, so that these rights are non-discriminatory and can be enjoyed by all individuals regardless of their status or background. This is reinforced by Article 9 which in Paragraph (3) states that, "Every individual has the right to enjoy a good and healthy living environment." Its meaning is similar to the previous chapter already mentioned. This article affirms that every individual has the fundamental right to enjoy, or to live in, an environment with good and healthy conditions, which is also part of the framework of human rights, so that it must be recognized and safeguarded and guaranteed in law. Therefore, every individual has the right to live a life in an environment that supports his or her health and well-being, and the duty of government is to protect and maintain that right. This article also highlights

the significance of human rights protection in the context of the environment. (Listiyani et al., 2018b)

With the legal basis derived from these laws and regulations, every individual has the right to enjoy a good, healthy living environment, which is a practice of the precepts in Pancasila and the 1945 NRI Constitution. This right is considered a fundamental need for every Indonesian citizen. Unfortunately, the recent environmental situation is far from being called a good and healthy living environment. Many environmental cases are not resolved or ignored, mainly because of the lack of active role of the government and society in fighting for basic rights related to a good and healthy environment. (Ardiansah & Satmoko Adi, n.d.)

One of the policies that can be taken to strengthen environmental law enforcement is through the implementation of licensing law policies. This is because the basic function of licensing law is to prevent or overcome environmental problems. This principle is in line with the provisions of Article 18 (1) of Law No. 32 of 2009, which stipulates that all companies or industries must obtain permits before operating. The article reads: "Every business and/or activity that has a major and important impact on the environment must have an analysis of environmental impacts to obtain a permit to conduct a business and/or activity. (Ardiansah & Satmoko Adi, n.d.)

There are still several problems related to licensing law, one of which is related to activities that require permits from various different agencies, depending on the type of permit needed for a particular business or activity. For example, an entrepreneur if he wants to set up a business needs to take care of various permits such as industrial business permits, then need building permits (IMB), also need location permits, there are also liquid waste disposal permits, and all of them come from different agencies. This process proves that the procedures in licensing in Indonesia tend to be sectoral. (Kurniawan et al., 2020)

Spelt and Ten Berge define a permit as an approval from the ruler in accordance with a law or government regulation, which allows a particular activity to violate the prohibition provisions of legislation in certain circumstances. As a consequence, a particular person or party is not allowed to carry out an activity unless obtaining permission from the government. These permits obtain normative value from the government and therefore must be supervised by the government as the approver. (Prihardiati, 2021)

In the context of licensing law, the government acts as the main agent acting as a decision maker to change the status of activities from not allowed to permitted, or vice versa. Sometimes, there are permits for activities that can damage the environment or harm the community, but are still allowed to be carried out. This creates dilemmas related to environmental impact and social justice. Things like this make the meaning of the connotation of licensing vague and carry negative connotations. Granting permission for activities that are less useful cannot be considered as neglect, because neglect is not the essence of permission. In order to be considered a permit, a constitutive decision by the official who has the authority to issue the permit is required. (Sukabumi et al., 2020)

Spelt and Ten Berge state that the motives for using permit systems can vary, as aspirations to regulate or control certain activities, prevent potential risks to the environment, protect specific objects, allocation of limited resources, and regulation through individual selection and activity. (Nugroho, 2017) The relationship between permit regulations and the environment is intended to ensure the protection of environmental quality by supervising certain actions or activities carried out by the community in general. In the UUPPLH, it is explained that licensing plays an instrument to prevent pollution and environmental destruction. An example of the implementation of licensing laws related to the environment is the granting of permits to individuals or legal entities who plan to establish a business or activity. In this case, conducting an Environmental Impact Assessment (Amdal) is a requirement that must be met to obtain a permit to carry out a business or activity.

UUPPLH emphasizes that the success or damage to the environment depends heavily on the regulation of licensing law. Environmental licensing legal policies made by the Central and Regional Governments, which are then manifested in positive laws such as laws or regional regulations, are an effort to prevent environmental quality degradation.

The legality of environmental licensing law is not only a policy concept, but also includes ecological practices. Thus, licensing law is not only limited to policy regulations, but also involves consistency in implementation and supervision. This is because environmental problems are seen not only as a result of economic activity or technological advances, but as policy issues that are manifestly reflected in their behavior and supervision. (Glica Aini Suniaprily et al., 2023c)

In this context, environmental licensing laws can have a significant impact on environmental sustainability. As well as licensing issues, environmental licensing laws can act as an effort to prevent pollution, acts of destruction, and damage to the environment, as well as repressive efforts involving government actions to people who run certain businesses or activities.

### 3.2. Law Enforcement in the Realm of Licensing related to Environmental Destruction Cases

Law enforcement in the licensing sector in Indonesia covers two main aspects, namely structuring and enforcement. This law enforcement process can be carried out through administrative and criminal sanctions. In general, law enforcement in the realm of licensing is more inclined towards administrative rules and administrative sanctions. Administrative law enforcement facilities related to licensing include supervision and application of government sanctions. Ten Berge argues that law enforcement instruments in the field of administrative law involve supervision and sanctions as a repressive effort to ensure compliance. (Eka Lestari et al., 2019b)

In the context of environmental licensing, law enforcement involves two main aspects, namely preventive and repressive approaches. The preventive approach includes supervision to prevent violations that can harm the environment. (Rosana, 2014) Meanwhile, the repressive approach involves the execution of punishments to stop, prosecute, and restore the situation to conform to the prevailing legal norms. Basic principles in licensing law enforcement involve monitoring and applying sanctions, which are essential measures to ensure compliance with regulations related to environmental conservation. (Syamsarina et al., 2022)

Licensing law enforcement efforts, there are several key aspects that need to be understood. First, the legitimacy aspect includes two main elements, namely the authority to supervise and the authority to impose sanctions. Second, legal instruments regarding the types of administrative sanctions and procedures for applying sanctions used in the context of licensing. (, 2015) Furthermore, administrative law norms include legal rules written as positive laws, and general principles of good governance (AUPB) which are the basis for licensing law enforcement. Finally, there is the concept of sanctions cumulation which includes the simultaneous imposition of sanctions between administrative sanctions and other legal sanctions. Accumulation can occur at both internal and external levels, creating situations known as internal cumulation and external cumulation. All of these aspects are integral to licensing law enforcement efforts to ensure environmental compliance and protection. (Son, 2016)

Administrative sanctions related to environmental permits, there are several types that can be explained as follows:

#### a. Coercive Sanctions

These sanctions are imposed in cases of violations of environmental licensing laws and may involve coercion. Coercion carried out by the Government is not always physical, but in urgent or forced circumstances, physical force can be used. (Lubis et al., 2020).

The implementation of coercion by the Government is an authority, not an obligation, and is only carried out when necessary. The authority of the Government in imposing these sanctions is free (*vrije bevoegheid*). The process of implementing coercive sanctions begins with an advance warning, both orally and in writing. However, if violators of environmental licensing laws do not respond to the warning, then these coercive sanctions will be applied. (Simamora & Zul, 2012)

b. Favorable Decision Withdrawal Sanctions

This type of sanction involves withdrawing decisions that provide benefits, such as permits, payments, and subsidies. There are two conditions that can lead to the withdrawal of favorable decisions, such as permits, as a sanctioning measure. First, if the interested party does not comply with the restrictions, terms, or provisions of legislation related to licensing law. Second, if the interested party provides data, but the data is incorrect or the data is incomplete when applying for permission, so that if the actual data is submitted, the decision will have a different status (for example, denial of permission). (Prof. Dr. H. Romli Atmasasmita, 2020)

License revocation as an administrative sanction is an authority attached to state administrative authority, especially in the context of granting permits. Then, license revocation in the context of sanctions can be *repartoir* (reinstatement) or *condemnatoir* (sanctions are given directly without trial).

c. Sanctions in the Form of Administrative Fines

This sanction implies the imposition of administrative fines in response to violations of norms. Administrative fines have differences with the imposition of forced money; In this context, administrative fines are applied to strengthen penalties, especially in terms of administrative fines contained in the field of tax law. (Otje Salman Dan Anthon F. Susanto, 2010)

d. Sanctions in the Form of Forced Money Payment

These sanctions involve forced payment of money as an option taken by the Government. Serves as an additional sanction (*subsidaire*) and also as a reparative sanction (*reinstatement*). Although at the practical level, this sanction has never been used because it has not been regulated in the positive law governing licensing. (Prof. Dr. B. Arief Sidharta, 2018)

Law enforcement related to environmental permits can also be analyzed through the lens of criminal sanctions. Criminal sanctions derived from criminal law involve actions against perpetrators of crimes or violations. Criminal sanctions in the form of penalties are imposed on those who violate licensing laws or are proven to be involved in crimes that harm the environment. Criminal punishment aims to provide a deterrent and suffering effect to perpetrators of criminal acts, so as to have a real impact on those involved in environmental destruction or violations of licensing laws. (Justice & Pidana, 2014)

Criminal sanctions have unique characteristics compared to legal sanctions in other areas, such as administrative sanctions or civil sanctions. Criminal sanctions are based on basic legal rules that prohibit in nature. If this basic rule is violated intentionally (*dolus*) or there is negligence (*culpa*), then enforcement in the form of criminal sanctions should not be ignored and no exceptions are given. (Nggeboe, 2012) All forms of action can be accounted for through the application of criminal sanctions to people who commit criminal acts, be it in the form of crimes or violations. The Criminal Code (KUHP) lists various types of criminal sanctions, which are implicitly described in Article 10 of the Criminal Code. (Muhaimin, 2019) In the context of law enforcement related to environmental permits, criminal sanctions can be grouped into two main categories. First, principal crime involving various forms of punishment as a result of violation of the law. The main types of crimes include: (a) Death Penalty: Extreme sanctions involving

loss of life as punishment for serious violations of environmental laws. Imprisonment: Offenders may be sentenced to imprisonment of varying degrees of duration, depending on the seriousness of the offense committed. (Policy Moderation Punishment Dead (Mei Susanto & Ajie Ramdan), n.d.) (b) Criminal Confinement: A criminal form that involves restricting one's freedom within a certain period as a result of a violation of the law. (Rusdiana, 2020), (c) Criminal Fine: Financial punishment that must be paid by the perpetrator of a criminal act as compensation for the offense committed. (Rusdiana, 2020), (d) Criminal Cover-up: Involves the closure or freezing of unlawful activities in response to those violations. (Nggeboe, 2012), (e) Second, additional crimes which are sanctions applied together with the main crime to provide additional effects or restrictions to criminal offenders. Additional types of criminal include: (f) Revocation of Certain Rights: Certain rights, such as political rights or property rights, may be revoked as additional sanctions. (g) Forfeiture of Certain Goods: Items related to the offense may be confiscated as part of additional criminal sanctions. (h) Announcement of Judge's Decision: The judge's decision and related information can be announced as a form of additional sanction, providing transparency and providing a deterrent effect to the public. (i) With the implementation of these two categories of sanctions, it is hoped that environmental law enforcement can be more effective and provide a preventive effect on violations of environmental licensing laws. (j) Regarding law enforcement in the field of environmental licensing from the perspective of criminal law, the focus of law enforcement efforts has reached the investigation stage. At this stage, it is expected that there will be an examination by a judicial institution, such as the District Court or the High Court. The resulting criminal verdict is expected to have a deterrent effect on perpetrators, although the application of criminal sanctions is considered the last solution in the context of law enforcement (*ultimum remedium*). Nevertheless, it is important to recognize that the application of criminal sanctions is not able to restore the condition of the environment that has been polluted and damaged. (k) The existence of limitations in the effectiveness of criminal sanctions related to environmental restoration shows weaknesses in the understanding of lawmakers regarding the crucial function of the environment in supporting human life. This is reinforced by the fact that the large number of criminal fines imposed on perpetrators of environmental destruction is not able to substantially compensate for the costs of damage that has occurred. Therefore, there is a need to increase understanding and awareness of the urgency of environmental protection in the design of legal policies so that their effectiveness can be more optimal and have a positive impact on the restoration of environmental conditions

#### 4. Conclusions

Indonesia has abundant natural wealth, but environmental pollution is a serious threat. The existence of underdevelopment and differences in conditions with developed countries are the main factors causing environmental problems. The importance of handling this problem is one of the alternatives through the implementation of licensing legal policies. Preventive measures, such as AMDAL, are required to obtain a business or activity license. Environmental licensing law can act as an effort to prevent pollution, destruction, and damage to the environment, as well as repressive efforts. (Ma'ruf, 2018)

Administrative and criminal sanctions are described as instruments of law enforcement, with different types of sanctions such as coercion, withdrawal of favorable decisions, administrative fines, and criminal penalties. However, there are limitations to criminal sanctions in restoring polluted environmental conditions. Better understanding, awareness-raising, and adjustment of legal policies are needed in order to effectively protect and maintain the environment in Indonesia. (Aritonang, 2021) The author's suggestion is to examine criminal sanctions in the environmental licensing aspect, not just looking at the administrative aspect.

This research provides practical insights for policymakers, regulatory bodies, and industry stakeholders regarding the effectiveness of environmental licensing policies. A profound understanding of the Environmental Impact Assessment (AMDAL) role as a preventive measure in obtaining business or activity permits is crucial for practitioners involved in policy development and environmental planning.

Furthermore, a deeper understanding of administrative and criminal sanctions offers practical guidance for law enforcement and environmental oversight institutions. By evaluating the limitations of criminal sanctions, stakeholders can identify areas where the law enforcement system needs strengthening and refinement. Theoretically, this research contributes to the understanding of environmental law and policy. In-depth exploration of the role of AMDAL and criminal sanctions within the framework of environmental licensing helps develop a richer theoretical foundation.

The author's suggestion to examine criminal sanctions in the environmental licensing aspect highlights the need for a holistic approach in analyzing law enforcement tools. The theoretical implications provide a conceptual framework that can be utilized by researchers and academics to deepen the understanding of the relationship between environmental policies, licensing, and law enforcement effectiveness. Overall, the practical and theoretical implications of this research create a strong foundation for the development and improvement of environmental policies in Indonesia, contributing significantly to the environmental law literature.

## References

- Ardiansah, D., & Satmoko Adi, A. (n.d.). *PERAN LSM ECOTON DALAM UPAYA MEMPERJUANGKAN HAK ATAS LINGKUNGAN HIDUP MASYARAKAT DAERAH ALIRAN SUNGAI BRANTAS*.
- Aritonang, D. M. (2021). KOMPLEKSITAS PENEGAKAN HUKUM ADMINISTRASI DAN PIDANA DI INDONESIA. *Jurnal Legislasi Indonesia*, 18(1), 45. <https://doi.org/10.54629/jli.v18i1.729>
- Eka Lestari, S., Djanggih, H., Wahidin Sudirohusodo No, J., Tuban, K., & Timur, J. (2019a). URGENSI HUKUM PERIZINAN DAN PENEGAKANNYA SEBAGAI SARANA PENCEGAHAN PENCEMARAN LINGKUNGAN HIDUP. In *Jilid* (Vol. 48, Issue 2).
- Eka Lestari, S., Djanggih, H., Wahidin Sudirohusodo No, J., Tuban, K., & Timur, J. (2019b). URGENSI HUKUM PERIZINAN DAN PENEGAKANNYA SEBAGAI SARANA PENCEGAHAN PENCEMARAN LINGKUNGAN HIDUP. In *Jilid* (Vol. 48, Issue 2).
- Glica Aini Suniaprily, F., Rohman, K., Batik Surakarta, I., Magister Hukum Ekonomi Syariah UIN Raden Mas Said Surakarta, P., Agus Salim No, J. H., Kec Laweyan Kota Surakarta Prov Jawa Tengah, S., & Pandawa Pucangan Kecamatan Kartasura Kabupaten Sukoharjo Propinsi Jawa Tengah, J. (2023a). Fungsi Kebijakan Hukum Perizinan Terhadap Upaya Pelestarian Lingkungan Hidup. *Jurnal Serambi Hukum*, 16.
- Glica Aini Suniaprily, F., Rohman, K., Batik Surakarta, I., Magister Hukum Ekonomi Syariah UIN Raden Mas Said Surakarta, P., Agus Salim No, J. H., Kec Laweyan Kota Surakarta Prov Jawa Tengah, S., & Pandawa Pucangan Kecamatan Kartasura Kabupaten Sukoharjo Propinsi Jawa Tengah, J. (2023b). Fungsi Kebijakan Hukum Perizinan Terhadap Upaya Pelestarian Lingkungan Hidup. *Jurnal Serambi Hukum*, 16.
- Glica Aini Suniaprily, F., Rohman, K., Batik Surakarta, I., Magister Hukum Ekonomi Syariah UIN Raden Mas Said Surakarta, P., Agus Salim No, J. H., Kec Laweyan Kota Surakarta Prov Jawa Tengah, S., & Pandawa Pucangan Kecamatan Kartasura Kabupaten Sukoharjo Propinsi Jawa Tengah, J. (2023c). Fungsi Kebijakan Hukum Perizinan Terhadap Upaya Pelestarian Lingkungan Hidup. *Jurnal Serambi Hukum*, 16.
- Justice, P. R., & Pidana, S. P. (2014). *PENERAPAN PRINSIP RESTORATIVE JUSTICE TERHADAP. 26–46. Kebijakan Moderasi Pidana Mati (Mei Susanto & Ajie Ramdan)*. (n.d.).

- Kurniawan, N. A., Hukum, J., & Kewarganegaraan, D. (2020). PERAN PARALEGAL DALAM PERLINDUNGAN SERTA PEMENUHAN HAK HUKUM MASYARAKAT. *Jurnal Praksis Dan Dedikasi Sosial (JPDS)*, 3(1), 28–33. <https://doi.org/10.17977/UM032V3I1P28-33>
- Listiyani, N., Hayat, M. A., & Mandala, S. (2018a). Penormaan Pengawasan Izin Lingkungan dalam Pencegahan Pencemaran dan Kerusakan Lingkungan Hidup dalam Eksploitasi Sumber Daya Alam. *Jurnal Media Hukum*, 25(2). <https://doi.org/10.18196/jmh.2018.0116.217-227>
- Listiyani, N., Hayat, M. A., & Mandala, S. (2018b). Penormaan Pengawasan Izin Lingkungan dalam Pencegahan Pencemaran dan Kerusakan Lingkungan Hidup dalam Eksploitasi Sumber Daya Alam. *Jurnal Media Hukum*, 25(2). <https://doi.org/10.18196/jmh.2018.0116.217-227>
- Lubis, M. A., Dhevi, R. S., & Yasid, M. (2020). PENEGAKAN HUKUM TERHADAP APARAT SIPIL NEGARA YANG MELAKUKAN PELANGGARAN HUKUM DALAM MEWUJUDKAN GOOD GOVERNANCE. *Jurnal Darma Agung*, 28(2), 269–285. <https://doi.org/10.46930/OJSUDA.V28I2.649>
- Ma'ruf, A. (2018). ASPEK HUKUM LINGKUNGAN HIDUP DALAM UPAYA MENCEGAH TERJADINYA KERUSAKAN DAN PENCEMARAN LINGKUNGAN HIDUP DI INDONESIA: Vol. XXIII (Issue 1).
- Muhaimin, M. (2019). Restoratif Justice dalam Penyelesaian Tindak Pidana Ringan. *Jurnal Penelitian Hukum De Jure*, 19(2), 185. <https://doi.org/10.30641/dejure.2019.v19.185-206>
- Nggeboe, F. (2012). SUATU TINJAUAN TENTANG PIDANA DENDA DALAM HUKUM PIDANA POSITIF INDONESIA DAN RANCANGAN KUHP. 1.
- Nugroho, W. (2017). Rekonstruksi Teori Hukum Pembangunan Kedalam Pembentukan Perundang-Undangan Lingkungan Hidup Dan Sumber Daya Alam Pasca Reformasi Dalam Bangunan Negara Hukum. *Jurnal Legislasi Indonesia*, 14(4), 369–382.
- Pendidikan, J., Sufia, R., & Amirudin, A. (n.d.). Tersedia secara online EISSN: 2502-471X KEARIFAN LOKAL DALAM MELESTARIKAN LINGKUNGAN HIDUP (STUDI KASUS MASYARAKAT ADAT DESA KEMIREN KECAMATAN GLAGAH KABUPATEN BANYUWANGI).
- Prihardiati, RR. L. A. (2021). Teori Hukum Pembangunan Antara Das Sein Dan Das Sollen. *HERMENEUTIKA : Jurnal Ilmu Hukum*, 5(1). <https://doi.org/10.33603/hermeneutika.v5i1.4898>
- Prof. Dr. B. Arief Sidharta, S. H. (2018). *Meuwissen tentang Pengembangan Hukum, Ilmu HUKUM, Teori Hukum dan Filsafat Hukum* (Aep Gunarsa SH, Ed.; kelima). PT Refika Aditama.
- Prof. Dr. H. Romli Atmasasmita, S. H. LL. M. (2020). *Moral Pancasila, hukum dan kekuasaan* (nurul falah Atif, Ed.). PT Refika Aditama.
- Putra, D. A. (2016). EKSISTENSI SISTEM HUKUM PERIZINAN KEGIATAN PERTAMBANGAN DALAM OTONOMI DAERAH SEBAGAI SALAH SATU INSTRUMEN HUKUM HAK-HAK MASYARAKAT (Vol. 24, Issue 1).
- Richard A. Posner, "Frontier Legal Theorie, Harvard University Press", 2001, hlm 13- 15, dalam Otje Salman dan Anthon F. Susanto, *Teori Hukum*, (Bandung: Refika Aditama, 2010), hlm 124-125. (n.d.).
- Rosana, E. (2014). Kepatuhan Hukum Sebagai Wujud Kesadaran Hukum Masyarakat. *Jurnal Tapis: Jurnal Teropong Aspirasi Politik Islam*, 10(1).
- Rusdiana, E. (2020). PENGENAAN PIDANA DENDA YANG DAPAT DIKONVERSI DENGAN PIDANA KURUNGAN PADA PELAKU ANAK. *Jurnal Yudisial*, 12(3), 363. <https://doi.org/10.29123/jy.v12i3.364>
- Simamora, E., & Zul, M. (2012). Penerapan Prinsip Good Governance Dalam Perpolisian Masyarakat Di Wilayah Hukum Polresta Medan. *Jurnal Mercatoria*, 5(1), 1–11.
- Sukabumi, P., Persyaratan Perizinan, P., Perizinan Dan Konsekuensi Perizinan Terhadap Perkembangan Usaha Mikro, P., Dan Menengah Di Kabupaten Sukabumi, K., Studi Administrasi Bisnis Jl Babakan Sirna No, P., Warudoyong, K., Sukabumi, K., & Barat, J. (2020). *Prosiding SEMNASTERA (Seminar Nasional Teknologi dan Riset Terapan) Herny Nurhayati*.

- Syamsarina, S., Aziz, M. I., Arzam, A., Hidayat, D., & Aji, A. B. W. (2022). Kesadaran Hukum dan Kepatuhan Hukum: Analisis Faktor yang Mempengaruhi Kesadaran Hukum dan Kepatuhan Hukum Masyarakat. *Jurnal Selat*, 10(1). <https://doi.org/10.31629/selat.v10i1.5216>
- , W. T. N. (2015). PENAFSIRAN HUKUM DALAM MENENTUKAN UNSUR-UNSUR KELALAIAN MALPRAKTEK MEDIK (MEDICAL MALPRACTICE). *Yustisia Jurnal Hukum*, 92. <https://doi.org/10.20961/YUSTISIA.V92I0.3832>